

Students as Evaluators: A Model for Meaningful Evaluation

2025 National Conference to Advance POGIL Practice (NCAPP)

Patricia B. Campbell, PhD (she/her)

Campbell-Kibler Associates, Inc.

campbell@campbell-kibler.com

617 852-3199

www.campbell-kibler.com

www.FairerScience.org

www.BeyondRigor.org



Agenda

I. Introductions and Links

<https://www.fairerscience.org/SEpresentation.pdf>

<https://www.fairerscience.org/SEhandout.pdf>

<https://www.fairerscience.org/SEworksheets.pdf>

II. Overview of Students as Evaluators

III. Evaluation Basics

IV. Going Through the Process (Part 1)

V. Break: Regroup as Needed

VI. Going Through the Process (Part 2)

VII. Lessons Learned and Next Steps

VIII. Evaluating the Workshop

Students as Evaluators

Goals:

- To provide students with the experience of being in charge while helping to build skills in written and oral communication and analysis.
- To provide program staff and/or instructors with *usable information* about the program.

Rules:

- Students need to be or have been participating in the project being evaluated
- Students must be treated and, see themselves, as evaluators including serving snacks at meetings.
- .Within any legal, ethical or safety constraints, the student evaluators will be making the decisions.
- Those in charge will implement the recommendations or explain why they aren't able.

Facilitator Responsibilities

- ▶ Check to see what, if any, permission is needed to do the evaluation.
- ▶ Get commitments from those running the program/teaching the course to review the findings and either implement the recommendations or explain why they can't.
- ▶ Get nominations /recruit 5- 10 Student Evaluators.
- ▶ Set up two 60-90 minute meetings several weeks apart.
- ▶ Troubleshoot the data collection process (and other areas) as needed.
- ▶ Serve as a facilitator and a coach rather than as a teacher or a boss.
- ▶ If the students are younger than high school, write the first draft of the report based on the data analysis for the students to review and revise.
- ▶ Assist in the dissemination process.

A Sample Project for Students to Evaluate

A high school Chemistry department has been using POGIL in their classes for the first time this year. The teachers have been trained in using POGIL but have different levels of experience working with groups in their classes. Class sizes are between 20 and 35 students.

It is now February and the department chair is concerned about how things are going and has asked you to find out. You've decided to use a Students as Evaluators model.

Phases of the Evaluation Process

Planning

- Determine project and evaluation goals
- Identify questions and indicators
- Select measures and a data collection plan
- Develop a time and task chart

Implementation

- Gather credible evidence (data collection)
- Conduct data analysis, interpretation, and synthesis
- Write up results

Reporting/Use of Results

- Report findings
- Disseminate findings and share lessons learned
- Encourage use of results
- Determine next steps, if any

Sample Student Evaluator Questions

- ▶ How do you decide from whom to collect data?
- ▶ How do you get people to be interviewed or to fill out a survey?
- ▶ How do you get people to trust you? To tell you about things they don't like as well as things they do?
- ▶ (For younger evaluators) How do you get adults and/or other students to take you seriously?
- ▶ Are there other questions you think should be asked?

In small groups discuss how you would answer their questions

Students as Evaluators: Part 1

Decide who will be the facilitator.

Decide the educational level of the Student Evaluators: Middle school? High school? First year college? Other?

Based on the described program, develop 2 or 3 evaluation questions to be answered.

Decide what the best, and doable, ways are to answer the questions including the data will be collected and by whom.

An Evaluation of Student Helpers in a Senior Center: A Sample Conclusion

Conclusion:

Helpers felt that Seniors and Helpers don't get along because the Seniors don't like them while the Seniors said they like the Helpers but are nervous and scared around them and don't know how to get to know them.

Recommendations:

As Student Evaluators, what recommendations would you make in response to this conclusion?

As the facilitator what guidance would you give them?

Students as Evaluators: Part 2



Critique and revise your plan as appropriate.

Plan the (theoretical) next steps.

Develop a time and task chart describing who will be doing what and when they will do it.

Develop a dissemination plan: who gets what information in what format.

An Evaluation of Student Helpers in a Senior Center: The Student Evaluators' Recommendations

Recommendations:

- ▶ Have Seniors and Helpers do collaborative projects where both the Helpers' and the Seniors' skills are needed to successfully complete the project.
- ▶ Senior/Helper communication must be improved so that Seniors and Helpers become more aware of each other's feelings and are aware of the goals of the program. Joint Senior/Helper seminar sessions can help achieve this.

Presentations of Plans and Questions



Thank you!

Chose one of the following to evaluate the workshop:

WORDS, WORDS, WORDS: List three words that best describe how you feel.

THE BIG THREE: List what you LIKED BEST and LIKED LEAST about the workshop and what would IMPROVE IT.

I THINK...: Complete one or several of the following: I THINK THE WORKSHOP IS..., TODAY I LEARNED THAT..., IN THE FUTURE I WILL....

If you decide to implement the Students as Evaluator and need more information or advice, contact Pat at campbell@campbell-kibler.com